Participation, Engagement & Behavior Change

What Works & What's Missing in Employee & Organizational Health

Jon Robison, PhD, MS, MA
“But this rapid escalation in employer investment has spawned a “Wild West” kind of market for wellness and disease management, with thousands of vendors overwhelming employers, often touting exaggerated claims of effectiveness.”

Leah Binder, Employers Reigning In Health Care Costs, But With A Twist
“The truth is that our finest moments are most likely to occur when we are feeling deeply uncomfortable...

For it is only in such moments, propelled by our discomfort, that we are likely to step out of our ruts and start searching for different ways or truer answers.”

M. Scott Peck
“Just How Things Are Done Around Here”
Evidence vs. Belief
Worksite Wellness
At a Crossroads

EVIDENCE

BELIEF
“An answer is an invitation to stop thinking about something, to stop wondering. Life has no such stopping places...

An unanswered question is a fine travelling companion. It sharpens your eye for the road.”

Rachel Naomi Remen, Kitchen Table Wisdom
WHAT IF?

A New Paradigm

Lots of:
- Questions
- Research
- Resources

Some:
- C L U E S
Organizational Wellbeing and Worksite Wellness are “stuck” in 17th Century Science?
17th Century - Scientific Revolution

“Mechanistic” Worldview

- Universe = a great machine
- Nature = huge clock, dead & inert
- No purpose, life or spirituality in matter
17th Century Science

- **Mechanistic**
  whole = the sum of its parts

- **Reductionist**
  analysis = to break down

- **Dualistic**
  matter & spirit separate

- **Patriarchal**
  aggression, competition and control
The Purpose of Science:
“to torture nature’s secrets from her so she can be forced out of her natural state and squeezed and molded.”

~ Sir Francis Bacon
"Man is more courageous, pugnacious, and energetic than woman, and has more inventive genius."

~ Charles Darwin (1859)
“Congressional Birth Control Hearing
Involves Exactly Zero People Who Have a Uterus”
The *Stuckness* - The Old Paradigm

**Worldview** — Mechanistic

**Science** — Reductionist
(Whole = sum of its parts)

**Culture** — Control oriented
(hierarchy, patriarchal)

**Health** — Biomedical
(fix the machine)

Traditional Approaches to Change

Extrinsic (controlled) Motivation

---

Quantum Physics
Outdated
Chaos & Complexity
Neuroscience

---

PNI
The Stuckness - 17th Century Science

Organizational Wellbeing

Behavior Change

Employee Wellbeing
The *Stuckness* - Organizational Wellbeing

“Scientific Management:” (control the machine)

- Human nature to “goof off”
- Job tasks broken down to component parts
- Micro-managing
- Pay for production

Frederick W. Taylor
“Each man must give up his own particular way of doing things, adapt his methods to the many new standards and grow accustomed to receiving and obeying instructions, covering details large and small, which in the past had been left to individual judgment. The workmen are to do as they are told.”

The **Stuckness** - Employee Wellbeing

“Health Risk Management” (control the machine)

- Reduce and analyze
- Measure and quantify
- Scare, cajole, pressure, persuade → Fear
- Behavior modification
- “Get” people to change

**Risk Factors**

**Control**
What If...

Worksite Wellness has been hijacked by the Biomedical Model?
"I consider the body as a machine
...my thought...compares a sick
man and an ill-made clock with my
idea of healthy man and a well-
made clock"

~ Renes Descartes
"There is nothing included in the concept of the body that belongs to the mind; and nothing in that of the mind that belongs to the body"

~ Renes Descartes
Six Dimensions Of Wellness

Dr. Bill Hettler - 1970’s
“I believe you have to address the things that matter most – and those core programs will be pretty much the same from worksite to worksite. These include physical activity, proper nutrition and preventive screening...”
Traditional Worksite Wellness

• Health Risk Assessments
• Biometric Screens
• Weight Loss/Nutrition
• Exercise
• Smoking Cessation
• Stress Management
Employee Wellbeing

5 Universal, Interconnected Elements:

- Career Wellbeing
- Social Wellbeing
- Financial Wellbeing
- Physical Wellbeing
  — Emotional Wellbeing
- Community Wellbeing
What If...

Workplace Wellness is “trapped” inside the 20\textsuperscript{th} Century’s \textit{“Skinner’s Box”?}
“Let’s face it... incentives are about getting people to do things they would otherwise not do”
Behaviors that are followed by rewards are likely to be repeated.
B.F. Skinner - “Behaviorism” (behavior modification)

• No Free Will

All human actions are “repertoires of behaviors” that can be fully explained by the environmental consequences that follow them.
"One of them is nice to the other and predisposes the other to be nice to him, and that makes him even more likely to be nice. It goes back and forth, and it may reach the point at which they are very highly disposed to do nice things to the other and not to hurt. And I suppose that is what would be called being in love."
“There is no place in the scientific analysis of behavior for a mind or a self”

Skinner, American Psychologist, 1990
B.F. Skinner: The Legacy

• Do This and You’ll Get That
  • School
  • Home
  • The Workplace
• **Extrinsic**- doing something due to pressure or tangible rewards rather than for the fun or interest of it - because someone is trying to get you to do it. *(controlled)*

• **Intrinsic**- doing something because it provides spontaneous satisfaction - doing it because you want to do it. *(autonomous)*

Extrinsic Motivation – The Research

- Does not produce long-term behavior change
- Diminishes performance
- Diminishes creativity
- Fosters short-term thinking
- Encourages cheating, lying, shortcuts, etc.
- Becomes habit forming
- Reduces or extinguishes intrinsic motivation
Extrinsic Motivation – The Research

1993

Punished by Rewards
Alfie Kohn

1995

Why We Do What We Do
Edward L. Deci

2009

Drive
Daniel H. Pink

2010

Management Rewired
Charles S. Jacobs
Extrinsic Motivation – The Research

Kramer et al., Behavior Therapy 1986:295-301
Windsor, 1988, J.Behav.Medicine;11:407-21
Matson et al., AJHP 1993;7(4):270-80, 295
Redmond et al., Center on Budget and Priority Policies, June 2007
Obesity Reviews 2007;9, 355-367
Cochrane Database of Reviews, Cahill & Perera, 2008, Issue 3
Volpp, Financial Incentive-Based Approaches for Weight Loss, JAMA 2008;300, 2631
Kevin Volpp et al., Randomized Controlled Trial of Financial Incentives, JAMA 2009;360:699-709
Competitions & Incentives for Smoking Cessation, Kate Cahill and Rafael Perera - April, 2011

Gingerich SB, et al. Impact of financial incentives on behavior change participation and risk reduction in worksite health promotion, American Journal of Health Promotion 2012;27(2)
Pay For Performance ??

• London School of Economics
• Review of 51 studies of corporate pay-for performance plans

“We find that financial incentives may indeed reduce intrinsic motivation and...can result in a negative impact on overall performance.”
### Hooked on Incentives

#### Average per Employee - Wellness-Based Incentives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Average Per Employee</th>
<th>NBGH Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>$460</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>$521</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>$594</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hooked on Incentives

Average per Employee - Wellness-Based Incentives

Companies With Fewer Than 5,000 Workers

- 2013: $444
- 2014: $595

34%

“Words are the most powerful drug used by mankind”

- How do we manage *human resources*?
- How can we “maximize” *human capital*?
- What’s best way to “drive” participation?
- How do we “get people” to change?
What If...

Participation and Engagement are **NOT** the same thing?
Participation & Engagement

• Participation - the act of taking part in something
• Engagement - how employees feel about their work

Engaged employees are committed to and excited about their work and willing to go the extra mile to make a difference
Incentives increase participation

Claim improved engagement

Bribing employees to participate may increase the numbers who do. But it says nothing about engagement - how they feel about their work.
Participation, Engagement & Incentives

- Bribing employees = Engagement
  = Participation
  = Compliance - conforming, acquiescing or yielding especially in weak/subservient way

If you want employees to participate, invite them to help you make the programs attractive enough so you don’t have to bribe them to do so.
Supporting Change Without Incentives

Create The Conditions

“Don’t ask how you can motivate others. That’s the wrong question.”

Ask how you can create the conditions within which others will motivate themselves.”

Dr. Edward Deci - http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VGrcets0E6I
Supporting Change Without Incentives

Create The Conditions

• **Autonomy** employees being able to think for themselves and direct their own actions

• **Mastery** opportunities to learn, grow & become highly skilled

• **Purpose** work that is meaningful & connected to a greater purpose
Supporting Change Without Incentives

Create The Conditions

“The Energy Project”
14,000+ global respondents, 24+ industries

“No single factor in our study comes close to influencing people's job satisfaction and likelihood to stay at an organization as much as the sense that their work gives them a sense of meaning and purpose.”

People are motivated by work that provides them with autonomy, growth, meaning, and purpose.

People can’t be paid or punished into these behaviors; they contribute or withhold their best efforts depending on how connected they feel to the organization, manager, or team.”
The current proliferation of worksite wellness programs is based on faulty research? non-existent
“Safeway figured out how to incentivize people to take better care of themselves, and they have flat-lined their health care costs for 200,000 employees in the last four years.”

Sen. Thomas R. Carper, Democrat, Delaware, Senate Finance Committee, September, 2009
“Safeway designed such a plan in 2005 and has made continuous improvement each year. The results have been remarkable, our health care costs for four years have been held constant.”

Steven A Burd, Safeway CEO, Wall Street Journal, June 12, 2009
The “Safeway Amendment”

The Rhetoric

“You know, there’s a guy who has become pretty famous lately, and he’s the CEO of Safeway... Safeway’s health-care costs have gone down. Why can’t we adopt that on a national scale.”

The “Safeway Amendment”

The Rhetoric

“It’s a program that has helped Safeway cut health-care spending by 13 percent and workers save over 20 percent on their premiums... And we’re open to help employers adopt and expand programs like these.”

President Barack Obama – June – American Medical Association speech
“Misleading claims about Safeway wellness incentives shape health-care bill”

David S. Hilzenrath, Washington Post
The “Safeway Fiasco”

The Reality

• Costs declined by 12.5% in 2006

• Program was not implemented until 2009
  - (only 28,000 out of 200,000 employees)

• 1st year of the program costs rose steeply

http://ilovebenefits.healthcarebenefitsnetwork.com/?p=3284
What If...

Tying employee health outcomes to rewards and punishments is a mistake?
“Although it may seem obvious that charging higher premiums for smoking (body mass index, cholesterol, or blood pressure) would encourage people to modify their habits to lower their premiums, evidence that differential premiums change health-related behavior is scant. Indeed, we’re unaware of any insurance data that convincingly demonstrate such effects.”

Volpp, et. Al, Redesigning Employee Health Incentives, NEJM 2011;365:388-390
The “Safeway Amendment”

The Reality

“We also have a pretty good idea of what doesn’t work, and heading the list are strategies that tie individual employees’ share of health insurance premiums to health-related behaviors and/or meeting benchmarks.”

Workplace wellness regulations: First do no harm. The Prevention Institute, The Greenlining Institute, 2013
The “Safeway Amendment”

Why Not?

- Punitive measures have not been linked to improved health outcomes
- May instill resentment in employees
- Shift health costs to the least healthy
- Most damaging effect on people of color and low-income workers

Workplace wellness regulations: First do no harm. The Prevention Institute, The Greenlining Institute, 2013
The “Safeway Amendment”

Why Not?

Preventive Health Partnership ACS, ADA, AHA

“Based on the evidence to date regarding the impact of financial incentives on behavior, we believe the potential to discriminate against persons with chronic conditions – like heart disease, cancer, and diabetes – far outweigh any potential benefits to improving wellness.”

“Wellness or Else”!

By 2016 the % of employers who will punish employees for not participating in their workplace wellness program is expected to triple.

- Now - 22%
- End of 2013 - 36%
- By 2016 – 61%

2013 Staying @Work Report from Towers Watson & Company
“Wellness or Else”!

How employees feel about it – 8/8/14

- 62% believe it is inappropriate to require workers to pay higher health insurance premiums if they do not participate in wellness programs

- 75% believe it is inappropriate to require workers to pay higher premiums if they are unable to meet certain health goals

What If...

When it Comes to **ROI**

Most People

Don’t Believe The Numbers Anyway?
“I don’t think I have ever read a research article on a workplace wellness program that did not show savings.”
“There is not one shred of evidence that a corporate wellness program can reduce the costs of your health benefit at all, let alone by more than the cost of the program.”

Tom Emerick, Cracking Health Costs, 2013
Selling Employee Wellness


• Managing Manifest Diseases, But Not Health Risks, Saved PepsiCo Money – 7 years - Health Affairs, January 2014 33:1124-131


Selling Employee Wellness

Fatally Flawed Research

• Comparing participants to non-participants
• Ignoring natural ebb & flow of risk factors
• Not including dropouts in the data
• Not tracking “wellness-sensitive” events

• Mathematical Improbability / Impossibility
Selling Employee Wellness

Fatally Flawed Research

- Screening ROIs = 4.8:1
- HRA ROIs = 14.3:1
- Weight loss = lbs. lost
- Savings in excess of 100%

Al Lewis, Is It Time To Re-Examine Workplace Wellness ‘Get Well Quick’ Schemes? Health Affairs Blog, 1/16/2013
Selling Employee Wellness

Fatally Flawed Research

Studies Claim Wellness Participants:

• 300% less likely to be absent due to illness
• 350% decrease in appt. waiting time
• 240% decline in # of people on disability

Al Lewis & Vik Khanna, Surviving Workplace Wellness, 2014
“The industry went in with promises of 3 to 1 and 6 to 1 based on health care savings alone – then research came out that said that’s not true – then they said ok we are cost neutral - and now as research says maybe not even cost neutral they say but is really about productivity which we can’t really measure but its an enormous return.”

Dr. Soeren Mattke, 2013
“What irks me are these aggressive sales tactics that make it a standard benefit based on unrealistic promises and then turning around and saying, but you shouldn’t look at savings in the first place”

Dr. Soeren Mattke, 2013
AL LEWIS
President of Disease Management Purchasing Consortium

Widely credited with inventing Disease Management

“The national leader in analyzing care management outcomes”
What If...

Workplace Wellness

"Wellness or Else"!

Can actually harm people?

The 4P's

Prv, Prod, Poke, Punish

Pry, Poke, Prod, Prv,
How We Do Harm

United States Preventive Services Task Force

- Cholesterol  ➔  Every 5 years
- Glucose ➔  Only with HBP
- Lung CT Scans ➔  Only chronic, heavy, smokers
- PSA ➔  USPSTF – “D”
“Organizational health” actually has little to do with gym memberships, broccoli in the cafeteria & deep breathing exercises
"The single greatest advantage any company can achieve is organizational health."
“Organizational” Health

In Order for An Organization to Succeed

**SMART**
- Strategy
- Marketing
- Finance
- Technology

**HEALTHY**
- Minimal Politics
- Minimal Confusion
- High Morale
- High Productivity
- Low Turnover
“Organizational” Health

“I’ve become absolutely convinced that the seminal difference between successful companies and mediocre or unsuccessful ones has little, if anything, to do with what they know or how smart they are; it has everything to do with how healthy they are.”

### What “We” Perceive as “Wellness”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Healthy Weight</th>
<th>Eating Fruits</th>
<th>Physically Active</th>
<th>Regular Preventive Care</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low Fat, High Fiber Diet</td>
<td>Normal Blood Pressure</td>
<td>Normal Cholesterol</td>
<td>Manage Stress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use alcohol in moderation</td>
<td>Normal Glucose</td>
<td>Non-Smoker</td>
<td>Eating Vegetables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting Enough Sleep</td>
<td>Use Sunscreen</td>
<td>Wear Seatbelts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
When Employees Feel “Un-well”

Company Doesn’t Care

- No time for me

OVERWHELMED

- Worried about layoffs
- Too much to do
- Not enough resources

Co-workers Don’t Care

- Unrealistic Company Demands
- Don’t like what I’m doing

- Pulled in too many directions at work & home
- Feel Trapped in my job
- All work and no play
- All work and no play
What CAN Save Money?

State of The American Workplace

70% of U.S. workers are not engaged

$450-$550 billion dollars a year

Good leaders

Good managers

Autonomy, Mastery, Purpose

Gallup Employee Engagement Insights for US Business Leaders - 2013
“Having too few engaged employees means our workplaces are less safe, employees have more quality defects, and disengagement – which results from terrible managers – is driving up the country’s healthcare costs.”
What CAN Save Money?

Managers & Organizational Performance

- **Red** – poor on every metric, especially turnover
- **Yellow** – average employee survey scores
- **Green** – terrific places to work – profitability, productivity, engagement, retention

“Let’s get rid of managers from hell, double the number of great managers and employees, and have those managers lead based on what actually matters...The country’s employees will be twice as effective, they’ll create far more customers, companies will grow, spiraling healthcare costs will decrease and desperately needed GDP will boom like never before.”
What DOES Save Money?

• Company Sponsored Centers of Excellence

• Leapfrog Hospital Safety Scores
  http://www.leapfroggroup.org/cp

• Co-ordinated Care Model
  www.dismgmt.com – gold standard

• Disease Management
"Most research suggests that the best way to reduce medical spending and absenteeism is to establish a culture that makes people *want* to go to work."

**TOM EMERICK**
former VP Global Benefit Design, Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
“We really want, in any way possible, to break down any gaps or anything between the top leaders and those who are closest to our patients,” Dunn said. “We feel like it's the right thing to do.”
“Starbucks to Provide Free College Education”

“I believe it will lower attrition, it’ll increase performance, it’ll attract and retain better people.”

New York Times, 6/16/14. Howard D. Schultz, the company’s chairman and chief executive
“Virgin founder Richard Branson Gives Employees Unlimited Vacation Time”

“Treat people as human beings, give them that flexibility and I don't think they'll abuse it. And they'll get the job done.”
“Large chunks of America’s healthcare cost aren’t sitting there waiting to be reduced by employees eating more broccoli. And yet, that’s what wellness is all about – generating the appearance of massive cost reduction by making employees promise to change a few health habits.”

Al Lewis & Vik Khanna, Surviving Workplace Wellness, 2014
Getting “Unstuck” - The New Paradigm

**Worldview** — Organic-Living

**Science** — Holistic
(Whole > sum of its parts)

**Culture** — Relationship-oriented
(equalitarian)

**Health** — Bio-psycho-social-spiritual
(holistic, ecological)

**Re-Thinking Approaches to Change**
Intrinsic (autonomous) Motivation
Coming Fall 2014 Rosie & Jon’s Brand-New Book!

Find out more and reserve your copies today at:
SalveoPartners.com

How to Build a Thriving Culture at Work
Featuring: The 7 Points of Transformation

“How to Build a Thriving Culture at Work”
SalveoPartners.com
Building Tomorrow’s Workplace
Rosie and Jon can transform your workplace!

Contact them for more information on their proven organizational development and employee wellbeing speaking and consulting services today!

Rosie Ward, PhD, MPH, MCHES, BCC

Jon Robison, PhD, MS, MA